Evidence-Based Practice:
Specific Methods and/or Therapeutic Relationship

Scott D. Miller, Ph.D.
International Center for Clinical Excellence

William R. Miller, Ph.D.
International Center for Clinical Excellence
The Evolution of Psychotherapy

• Since the 1960’s:
  • *Number of treatment approaches grown from 60 to 400+*;
  • 55,000 “how to” books published on psychotherapy;
  • 80 psychological treatments for 27 of the 157 official diagnoses in DSM V.

The Evolution of Psychotherapy: The Evidence

- No difference in outcome between treatment approaches;
- Taken together, comparative, component (dismantling), mediating variable, & aptitude-by-treatment studies all show that specific ingredients are NOT needed to achieve a good outcome.


The Evolution of Psychotherapy: Do Treatments vary in Efficacy?

- Meta-analysis of all studies published between 1980-Present comparing bona fide treatments for children with ADHD, conduct disorder, anxiety, or depression:
  - No difference in outcome between approaches intended to be therapeutic;
  - Researcher allegiance accounted for 100% of variance in effects.

The Evolution of Psychotherapy: Do Treatments vary in Efficacy?

- Meta-analysis of all studies published between 1960-Present comparing bona fide treatments for alcohol abuse and dependence:
  - No difference in outcome between approaches intended to be therapeutic;
  - Approaches varied from CBT, 12 steps, Relapse prevention, & PDT.
  - Researcher allegiance accounted for 100% of variance in effects.

The Evolution of Psychotherapy:
Do Treatments vary in Efficacy?

• Meta-analysis of all studies published between 1989-Present comparing bona fide treatments for PTSD:
  • Approaches included desensitization, hypnotherapy, PD, TTP, EMDR, Stress Inoculation, Exposure, Cognitive, CBT, Present Centered, Prolonged exposure, TFT, Imaginal exposure.
  • Unlike earlier studies, controlled for inflated Type 1 error by not categorizing treatments thus eliminating numerous pairwise comparisons;

The Evolution of Psychotherapy: Do Treatments vary in Efficacy?

• The results:

  • No difference in outcome between approaches intended to be therapeutic on both direct and indirect measures;
  
  • $D = .00$ (Upper bound $E.S = .13$)

• $NNT = 14$;

  (14 people would need to be treated with the superior Tx in order to have 1 more success as compared to the “less” effective Tx).

The Evolution of Psychotherapy: The Evidence

“Decades of psychotherapy research have failed to find a scintilla of evidence that any specific ingredient is necessary for therapeutic change.”


The Evolution of Psychotherapy:

What Does Matter?
The Evolution of Psychotherapy:
What Does Matter?

• Some therapists achieve consistently better results than others;
• Differences between therapists consistently accounts for 5-9% of variability in treatment outcome;
• Differences persist when therapist competence is held constant and treatments are manualized;
• Difference is unrelated to age, gender, caseload, theoretical orientation, social skills, professional degree, years of experience, and time spent conducting therapy.
The Evolution of Psychotherapy

"The process whereby organisms better adapted to their environment tend to survive."

Top Performing Clinicians:

• Deliver more reliably effective treatment;
• Achieve 50% better outcomes;
• Suffer 50% fewer dropouts;
• Provide more value per dollar spent.
The Evolution of Expertise: How Top Therapists Improve?

Deliberate Practice


**Hours per week spent alone seriously engaging in activities related to improving therapy skills**

To carry out a particular activity regularly
Deliberate Practice

Zone of “Proximal Development”:
- Reliable performance inconsistent
- Identification of errors, misperceptions
- Setting small process and outcome objectives
- Involves planning, rehearsal, reflection

Realm of “Reliable” Performance:
- Processes executed quickly, automatically
- Involves recognition, retrieval, execution

Ambit of Admiration:
- Abilities of others appear flawless, magical, dramatic
- Effort and attention focused on easily recognized, but non-causal factors and/or processes (superstition)
- Risk of failure and injury high
Deliberate Practice

MEASURE

• Give at the beginning of the visit;
• Client places a hash mark on the line.
• Each line 10 cm (100 mm) in length.

Individually:
(Personal well-being)

-----------------------------------

Interpersonally:
(Family, close relationships)

-----------------------------------

Socially:
(Work, School, Friendships)

-----------------------------------

Overall:
(General sense of well-being)

-----------------------------------

• Scored to the nearest millimeter.
• Add the four scales together for the total score.

The Evolution of Psychotherapists:

- Give at the end of visit;
- Each line 10 cm in length;
- Score in cm to the nearest mm;
- Discuss with client anytime total score decreases or falls below 36.
DELIBERATE PRACTICE


### The Evolution of Psychotherapy

#### What Does Make a Difference?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th># Studies</th>
<th># Patients</th>
<th>Effect Size d</th>
<th>% of variability in outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Common Factors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alliance</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>2630</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>3599</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>.090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal Consensus/collaboration</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1302</td>
<td>.72</td>
<td>.115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Regard/Affirmation</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1067</td>
<td>.56</td>
<td>.073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congruence/Genuiness</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>863</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td>.057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Specific Ingredients</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differences between treatments</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>&gt;5900</td>
<td>&lt;.20</td>
<td>&lt;.010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adherence to protocol</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>1334</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rated competence in delivering</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>633</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>particular treatment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


# The Evolution of Psychotherapy: What Does Make a Difference?

## Common Factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th># Studies</th>
<th># Patients</th>
<th>Effect Size d</th>
<th>% of variability in outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alliance</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>2630</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>3599</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>.090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal Consensus/collaboration</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1302</td>
<td>.72</td>
<td>.115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Regard/Affirmation</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1067</td>
<td>.56</td>
<td>.073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congruence/Genuiness</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>863</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td>.057</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Specific Ingredients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th># Studies</th>
<th># Patients</th>
<th>Effect Size d</th>
<th>% of variability in outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Differences between treatments</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>&gt;5900</td>
<td>&lt;.20</td>
<td>&lt;.010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adherence to protocol</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>1334</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rated competence in delivering particular treatment</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>633</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


# The Evolution of Psychotherapy: What Does Make a Difference?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th># Studies</th>
<th># Patients</th>
<th>Effect Size d</th>
<th>% of variability in outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Common Factors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alliance(^a)</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>2630</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.075</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy(^a)</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>3599</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>.090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal Consensus/collaboration(^a)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1302</td>
<td>.72</td>
<td>.115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Regard/Affirmation(^a)</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1067</td>
<td>.56</td>
<td>.073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congruence/Genuiness(^a)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>863</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td>.057</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Specific Ingredients</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differences between treatments(^b)</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>&gt;5900</td>
<td>&lt;.20</td>
<td>&lt;.010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adherence to protocol(^c)</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>1334</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rated competence in delivering particular treatment</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>633</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


THE EVIDENCE
How Do Therapists Develop?

The only study to date documenting individual therapist improvement:
- 153 therapists;
- 5000+ clients.

Outcomes improved year after year.

Deliberate Practice
The Therapeutic Factors

PLAN

• **Model & Technique (1%)**: Structure, explanation, strategy, ritual

• **Hope & Allegiance (4%)**: Belief in the process and expectation of results

• **Relationship (8-9%)**: Understanding, empathy, collaboration